BEFORE THE OFFICE OF TAX APPEALS STATE OF CALIFORNIA

IN	THE	MATTER	OF	THE	APPEAL	OF:)			
)			
L.	PAX	ΓON,)	OTA	NO.	21108752
)			
				Z	Appellar	nt.)			
)			

CERTIFIED COPY

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

Cerritos, California

Wednesday, August 17, 2022

Reported by:

ALYSSA FULMER Hearing Reporter

Job No.: 38221 OTA(A)

1	BEFORE THE OFFICE OF TAX APPEALS
2	STATE OF CALIFORNIA
3	
4	
5	IN THE MATTER OF THE APPEAL OF:)
6) L. PAXTON,) OTA NO. 21108752
7) Appellant.)
8)
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS, taken at
17	12900 Park Plaza Drive, Suite 300, Cerritos,
18	California, commencing at 1:09 p.m. and
19	concluding at 1:26 p.m. on Wednesday,
20	August 17, 2022, reported by Alyssa Fulmer,
21	Hearing Reporter.
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	APPEARANCES:	
2		
3	Panel Lead:	KENNY GAST
4		
5	For the Appellant:	LYNN PAXTON
6		
7	For the Respondent:	STATE OF CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF TAX AND FEE
8		ADMINISTRATION ERIC BROWN & ERIC YADAO
9		ERIC BROWN & ERIC TIBLIO
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

1	I N D E X
2	
3	EXHIBITS
4	(Appellant's Exhibit 1-2 received at page 6)
5	(Respondent's Exhibit A-I received at page 6)
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	PRESENTATION
11	PAGE
12	By Ms. Paxton 6
13	by Mr. Brown 12
14	
15	
16	CLOSING ARGUMENT
17	PAGE
18	By Ms. Paxton 13
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	Cerritos, California; Wednesday, August 17, 2022
2	1:09 p.m.
3	
4	JUDGE GAST: All right.
5	Why don't we go on the record.
6	This is appeal of Paxton, case number 21108752.
7	Today's Wednesday, August 17th, 2022, and the time is
8	approximately 1:09 p.m.
9	We're holding this hearing in person in Cerritos,
10	California. My name is Kenny Gast and I'm the sole
11	administrative law judge for this appeal. Appellant elected to
12	have this appeal pursuant to the procedures of the small case
13	program, which required the assignment of a single
14	administrative law judge.
15	At this time I would like to ask the parties to please
16	identify yourself by stating your first and last name for the
17	record, beginning with Appellant.
18	THE APPELLANT: Lynn Paxton.
19	MR. BROWN: Eric Brown, California Franchise Tax
20	Board.
21	MR. YADAO: Eric Yadao, Franchise Tax Board.
22	JUDGE GAST: Thank you.
23	Okay. The issue in this case is whether Appellant has
24	established reasonable cause to abate the mandatory electronic
25	payment penalty for the 2019 board for the 2020 tax year.

Exhibits. With respect to the evidentiary record, Appellant has provided Exhibits 1 and 2 and FTB did not object to the admissibility of these exhibits; therefore, these exhibits are entered into the record. Note that Appellant did submit an Exhibit 3, but that is legal argument and will be considered as such for this appeal.

FTB has provided Exhibits A through I. Appellant has not objected to the admissibility of these exhibits; therefore, these exhibits are entered into the record.

Okay. At this point I'd like to move on to the parties' presentations and I will ask, Ms. Paxton, you will have 10 minutes for your presentation, if you could please stand and raise your right hand and I will swear -- actually, you can sit down. That's fine. If you can turn your microphone on. Thank you.

Please raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear, affirm, that the testimony you're about to give is the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

THE APPELLANT: I do.

2.4

JUDGE GAST: Thank you.

Please, begin whenever you're ready.

MS. PAXTON: I'm Lynn Paxton. As you know I, um, am a Realtor and I manage properties. I have been in this kind of business my entire life. I do not have any employees. I am not a lawyer. I am not a tax professional. I try to do things by

the book, I think I do, and yet I find myself in this position, which is why I'm here.

2.4

The first thing I did was to look up this

California Code Revenue and Taxation Code RTC 19011.5 which
says, "Any taxpayer required to electronically remit payment
pursuant to the section who makes payment by other means shall
pay a penalty of one percent of the amount paid, unless it is
shown that the failure to make payment as required was for
reasonable cause and was not the result of willful neglect."

As I said, I am not a lawyer. So I looked up willful neglect. I looked up "willful." I looked up "neglect." I looked up "reasonable cause" in the Oxford English Dictionary, Volume I and II. I did not engage in any willful neglect with respect to the electronic payment of the monies due to the FTB. I did not disregard or pay little or no intention to or leave unnoticed my obligations to pay these funds electronically. To the contrary, I took three proactive steps to ensure the payment could be made and could be made electronically.

I had made available for wire transfer a sufficient -a sufficient sum of money to accommodate what might be due to
the FTB. The sum was sitting in my bank account and was not
encumbered for any alternate purpose. This sum is sitting in
the bank account that I used to write the check in this case or
would have wired for this payment, and it shows on one of my
exhibits that a deposit was received by the bank on the 15th. I

believe you have that exhibit.

2.4

Two, I had ongoing discussions with my accountants, Pomerantz Kavinoky CPAs, a large accounting firm in Woodland Hills, about this FTB payment, how much it would be and when it was due so I could be prepared and could wire the monies in an orderly and timely fashion. I like to do things in an orderly and timely fashion and I am prepared to be able to do things in an orderly and timely fashion.

These discussions with my accountant began in the early part of the year, we're talking about in February and March, when I turned in all of my records over to them so that they can -- they can find out and tell me what I owed from my taxes. And over the course of this year, they posed questions and I answered them. I posed questions, they answered them, all like normal.

Unfortunately, for reasons I'll get into in a minute or two, this came down to the wire. They did not have my taxes figured out. They did not have the amount conveyed to me. They did not have the means for me to transfer the monies to the FTB conveyed to me in a timely fashion. So I ended up, on the day that these monies were due, sitting in my office from 10:00 a.m. on waiting for a transmittal from my accountants with the form I was supposed to wire in and the sum I was supposed to wire in and the directions how to do this. In the past, I had not done it. In the past when it was done, it was done by either with my

accountants doing it on my behalf or with me.

2.4

I'm not an accountant. I need help on that sort of thing. I don't do that every day. I was very nervous that day. These three steps are not the actions of someone who is, quote, "asserting their own will against persuasion," according to the dictionary, "are governed by will without regard to reason." These are the actions of somebody who wants to get something done right, preferably sooner rather than later. These are the steps taken by myself believing these steps would lead to the proper electronic payment of the sums owed in a timely fashion.

It's also my belief that, as evidenced above, willful neglect on my part did not occur in this case. Failure to comply with the requirements to wire the monies owed occurred, despite the exercise of ordinary business care and prudence. My ability to wire the monies depended on my receiving the appropriate forms and wiring instructions from my accountants in a timely manner. I'm not an accountant. I'm not prepared to figure out what I should be owing the FTB. That's why I hire the accountants. My accountants did not perform the forms that -- provide the forms and other information in a timely manner.

Their sending arrived in the afternoon of the due date of the electronic payment. The fact that they left the sending of this vital information until it was too late, in my view, was, according to them, due to the fact that my accountant and

his staff were completely overworked and unclear about how to interpret the then new tax law and, B, understaffed due to personnel losses attributed to COVID illnesses as well as due to the need of child oversight by some staff due to school closures. To ignore these factors and pretend COVID had no overwhelming impact on our economy and on everyone's business is not, in my opinion, realistic.

2.4

I'm not a tax professional. I am reliant upon the services of my tax professionals who are retained for the purpose of preparing the appropriate forms and guiding me through the process of correctly wiring the monies to the FTB, much like an escrow officer would oversee the wiring of monies in the purchase of a property.

I needed their help. This did not happen. And as a result, I made a choice that seemed the most prudent at the time as it addressed getting the payment to the FTB on time and that seemed to me to be my primary obligation. In previous correspondence I have gone over the fact that I was of the opinion that one could not wire monies after a certain time of day, either 12:00 noon or 1:00 depending on the bank or it would be accrued to the next day. This is due to my real estate experience. This is how it is in real estate and that's what I had been doing since 1996. So I had assumed all wires were like that. I later found out that that's not the case. I just wanted to touch on that in case it's desired to go into that at

greater length.

2.4

Just cause again, Oxford English Dictionary, Volumes I and II, is defined as good, proper, or adequate grounds of action. Reasonable cause is a lesser bar and would allow for a simple mistake occurring in a time of undue stress and dislocation, despite the exercise of ordinary business care and prudence by me. May I note that the cases referred to in Mr. Brown's letter of 12/6/21 were not adjudicated during a pandemic wherein one million of our citizens died and wherein even the court system closed down for a period of time. The ramification of the COVID event from my accountants and thus for me as a dependent of them and the availability of their services in a timely manner in order to fulfill my obligation to the FTB are such as to provide me reasonable cause, in my opinion, for making the best choice I could under difficult circumstances.

I would add that there were no negative ramifications financially to the FTB as a result of my actions. The payment due to the FTB was paid in full and on time.

JUDGE GAST: Thank you, Ms. Paxton.

THE APPELLANT: Thank you.

JUDGE GAST: At this point I'm going to turn it over to the FTB for questions of Ms. Paxton. But before I do that, I think we have the internet on now.

Would you like to check that, Mr. Brown? Do you have access?

1	MR. BROWN: That would be wonderful.
2	JUDGE GAST: Okay.
3	MR. BROWN: Would that be in the jet pack?
4	JUDGE GAST: Yes.
5	We can go off the record for Ms. Paxton. Thank you.
6	(Off the record)
7	JUDGE GAST: Okay. Back on the record and proceed.
8	Did I hear that, Mr. Brown? No questions for
9	Ms. Paxton?
10	MR. BROWN: That's correct.
11	JUDGE GAST: Okay.
12	Then I'm going to allow you to present for 10 minutes,
13	FTB. Whenever you're ready, please begin.
14	MR. BROWN: Thank you.
15	I'm Eric Brown, Tax Counsel with the California
16	Franchise Tax Board, and with me today is Eric Yadao also from
17	Franchise Tax Board.
18	The issue in this appeal is whether Appellant has
19	shown reasonable cause for paying by check instead of paying
20	electronically. This appeal is not about appellant's ability to
21	pay. It is about the method of payment. Appellant argues she
22	has established reasonable cause to abate the mandatory e-pay
23	penalty based on her mistaken belief about FTB's web pay system.
24	However, Appellant has not shown that FTB's web pay system was
25	inoperable at the due date of the payment nor did she experience

difficulties with FTB's web page system.

2.4

Appellant also believes that she has established reasonable cause because of the 2020 COVID-19 environment was not normal. In this regard, Appellant makes no connection between her decision to pay by check instead of remitting the payment electronically. The Appellant has not shown reasonable cause to abate the mandatory e-pay penalty.

And I would be happy to take any questions that the Appellant may have.

JUDGE GAST: Thank you very much, Mr. Brown.

At this point, I'm going to allow Ms. Paxton five minutes on rebuttal. So whenever you're ready, please begin.

THE APPELLANT: Thank you.

I would just say I would just reiterate what my comments were before. I'm not a tax professional. I am not able to do that work. So it's not only that my tax professional has told me that there were difficulties causing delays, um, due to the new tax law, due to the fact that he has a large office, many women work for him, many people, both men and women. I don't know how many, but several have come down with COVID at one period or another. Several of the women had children who were in school and then the schools closed and someone had to take care of them. They did. So what that did was to reduce his overall staff. Meaning even if he got no new clients at all, he did have a new tax law and he did have a reduced staff

1 to service the clients he already did have year in, year out. 2 had had this accountant for a year -- I don't know how many 3 years, but I'd guess fifteen. And as a result of issues like 4 this, I have a new tax accountant. But it's not my choice. just am dependent upon him. So, yes, COVID did have an effect 5 on this and on almost all of us in one way or another. 6 7 Thank you. JUDGE GAST: Thank you, Ms. Paxton. 8 9 I do not have any questions for the parties, but I 10 want to thank you both for your presentations. This will conclude the hearing. This appeal will be 11 decided based on the arguments, documents, and testimony 12 13 presented. A written opinion will be issued no later than a 14 hundred days from today. And now the case is submitted and the 15 record is closed. Thank you. We will take a brief recess before the next hearing 16 17 which will begin in, approximately, 10 minutes. 18 MR. BROWN: Thank you. 19 MR. YADAO: Thank you, Judge. 20 (Conclusion of the proceedings at 1:26 p.m.) 21 2.2 23 2.4 25

1	CERTIFICATE OF
2	HEARING REPORTER
3	
4	
5	The undersigned Hearing Reporter does hereby certify:
6	That the foregoing was taken before me at the time and
7	place therein set forth, at which time the witness was duly
8	sworn by me;
9	That the testimony of the witness and all objections
LO	made at the time of the deposition were recorded
L1	stenographically by me and thereafter transcribed, said
L2	transcript being a true copy of my shorthand notes thereof.
L3	In witness whereof, I have subscribed my name this
L4	date: September 9th, 2022.
L5	alys
L6	
L7	Alyssa Fulmer
L8	
L9	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	Α	APPEARANCES 3:1	Brown's 11:8 business 6:24
1 6:2	A-I 4:5	Appellant 2:7 3:5 5:11,17,18,23 6:2,	9:14 10:6 11:6
1-2 4:4	a.m. 8:21	4,7,19 11:20 12:18,21,24	С
10 6:12 12:12 10:00 8:21	abate 5:24 12:22 ability 9:15 12:20	appellant's 4:4 12:20	California 2:2,18 3:7 5:1,10,19 7:4
12 4:13	access 11:25	approximately	12:15
12/6/21 11:8	accommodate	5:8	care 9:14 11:6
12900 2:17	7:20	argues 12:21	case 5:6,12,23
12:00 10:20	account 7:21,23	argument 4:16 6:5	7:23 9:12 10:24, 25
13 4:18	accountant 8:9 9:2,17,25	arrived 9:22	cases 11:7
15th 7:25	accountants 8:2,	asserting 9:5	Cerritos 2:17 5:1.
17 2:20 5:1	22 9:1,16,19	_	9
17th 5:7	11:11	assignment 5:13	check 7:23 11:24
19011.5 7:4	accounting 8:3	assumed 10:23	12:19
1996 10:23	accrued 10:21	attributed 10:3	child 10:4
1:00 10:20	action 11:4	August 2:20 5:1,7	choice 10:15 11:15
1:09 2:18 5:2,8	actions 9:4,7 11:17	availability 11:12	circumstances
1:26 2:19	add 11:16	В	11:15
	addressed 10:16	Peak 40:7	citizens 11:9
2	adequate 11:3	Back 12:7	closed 11:10
2 6:2	adjudicated 11:8	bank 7:21,23,25 10:20	CLOSING 4:16
2019 5:25	ADMINISTRATIO	bar 11:4	closures 10:5
2020 5:25	N 3:8	based 12:23	Code 7:4
2022 2:20 5:1,7	administrative	began 8:9	commencing 2:18
21108752 2:6 5:6	5:11,14	begin 6:21 12:13	completely 10:1
	admissibility 6:3,	beginning 5:17	completely 10.1
	affirm 6:17	behalf 9:1	. ,
3 6:5	afternoon 9:22	belief 9:11 12:23	concluding 2:19
300 2:17	alternate 7:22	believing 9:9	considered 6:6
	Alyssa 2:20	board 5:20,21,25	contrary 7:17
6	amount 7:7 8:18	12:16,17	conveyed 8:18, 20
6 4:4,5,12	appeal 2:5 5:6,11,	book 7:1	correct 12:10
U 7.7,0,12	12 6:6 12:18,20 APPEALS 2:1	Brown 3:8 4:13 5:19 11:24 12:1,3, 8,10,14,15	correctly 10:11

Index: correspondence..kind

correspondence economy 10:6 fashion 8:6,7,8,20 10:18 Н 9:10 elected 5:11 **Counsel** 12:15 February 8:10 electronic 5:24 hand 6:13,16 **court** 11:10 7:14 9:10,23 **FEE** 3:7 happen 10:14 **COVID** 10:3,5 electronically figure 9:18 hear 12:8 7:5,16,18 12:20 11:11 figured 8:18 hearing 2:21 5:9 **CPAS** 8:3 employees 6:24 financially 11:17 **Hills** 8:4 encumbered **find** 7:1 8:12 D 7:22 hire 9:18 fine 6:14 **ended** 8:20 holding 5:9 date 9:22 12:25 firm 8:3 engage 7:13 day 8:20 9:3 form 8:22 I English 7:12 11:2 10:20,21 forms 9:16,19,20 ensure 7:17 defined 11:3 identify 5:16 10:10 entered 6:4,9 **DEPARTMENT** ignore 10:5 found 10:24 3:7 entire 6:24 **II** 7:13 11:3 Franchise 5:19, depended 9:15 Eric 3:8 5:19,21 21 12:16,17 illnesses 10:3 12:15,16 dependent 11:12 **FTB** 6:2,7 7:14,21 impact 10:6 **escrow** 10:12 8:4,19 9:18 10:11, depending 10:20 information 9:20, 16 11:13,17,18,22 established 5:24 deposit 7:25 12:13 24 12:22 desired 10:25 inoperable 12:25 FTB's 12:23,24 estate 10:21,22 dictionary 7:12 instructions 9:16 **fulfill** 11:13 event 11:11 9:6 11:2 full 11:18 intention 7:15 everyone's 10:6 died 11:9 Fulmer 2:20 internet 11:23 evidenced 9:11 difficult 11:15 interpret 10:2 **funds** 7:16 evidentiary 6:1 directions 8:24 issue 5:23 12:18 exercise 9:14 discussions 8:2, G 11:6 J **exhibit** 4:4,5 6:5 dislocation 11:6 **Gast** 3:3 5:4,10,22 8:1 6:20 11:19,21 disregard 7:15 jet 12:3 12:2,4,7,11 **exhibits** 6:1,2,3,4, **Drive** 2:17 judge 5:4,11,14, 7,8,9 7:25 give 6:17 22 6:20 11:19,21 **due** 7:14,20 8:5,21 experience 10:22 12:2,4,7,11 **good** 11:3 9:22,25 10:2,3,4, 12:25 21 11:18 12:25 governed 9:6 Κ greater 11:1 F Ε grounds 11:3 Kavinoky 8:3 fact 9:23,25 10:18 guiding 10:10 Kenny 3:3 5:10 **e-pay** 12:22 factors 10:5 kind 6:23 **early** 8:10 failure 7:8 9:12

L	minute 8:16	orderly 8:6,8	perform 9:19
	minutes 6:12 12:12	ordinary 9:14 11:6	period 11:10 person 5:9
large 8:3	mistake 11:5	OTA 2:6	•
late 9:24	mistaken 12:23	oversee 10:12	personnel 10:3
law 5:11,14 10:2	money 7:20	oversight 10:4	persuasion 9:5
lawyer 6:25 7:10	monies 7:14 8:5,	overwhelming	Plaza 2:17
lead 3:3 9:9	19,21 9:13,15	10:6	point 6:10 11:21
leave 7:15	10:11,12,19	overworked 10:1	Pomerantz 8:3
left 9:23	move 6:10	owed 8:12 9:10,13	posed 8:13,14
legal 6:5		owing 9:18	position 7:1
length 11:1	N	Oxford 7:12 11:2	preferably 9:8
lesser 11:4	needed 10:14		prepared 8:5,7
letter 11:8	negative 11:16	P	9:17
life 6:24	neglect 7:9,11,13		preparing 10:10
looked 7:10,11,12	9:12	p.m. 2:18,19 5:2,8	present 12:12
losses 10:3	nervous 9:3	pack 12:3	presentation
Lynn 3:5 5:18	noon 10:20	paid 7:7 11:18	4:10 6:12
6:22	normal 8:15	pandemic 11:9	presentations 6:11
	note 6:4 11:7	Panel 3:3	pretend 10:5
M	number 5:6	Park 2:17	previous 10:17
made 7:18,19		part 8:10 9:12	primary 10:17
10:15	0	parties 5:15	proactive 7:17
make 7:8	object 6:2	parties' 6:11	-
makes 7:6	objected 6:8	past 8:24,25	procedures 5:12
making 11:15	-	Paxton 2:6 3:5	proceed 12:7
manage 6:23	obligation 10:17 11:13	4:12,18 5:6,18 6:11,22 11:19,22	PROCEEDINGS 2:16
mandatory 5:24	obligations 7:16	12:5,9	process 10:11
12:22	occur 9:12	pay 7:7,15,16	professional
manner 9:17,21	occurred 9:13	12:21,23,24	6:25 10:8
11:13	occurring 11:5	paying 12:19	professionals
March 8:11	_	payment 5:25	10:9
MATTER 2:5	office 2:1 8:21	7:5,6,8,14,17,24 8:4 9:10,23 10:16	program 5:13
means 7:6 8:19	officer 10:12	11:17 12:21,25	proper 9:10 11:3
method 12:21	ongoing 8:2	penalty 5:25 7:7	properties 6:23
microphone 6:14	opinion 10:7,19 11:14	12:23	property 10:13
million 11:9	order 11:13	percent 7:7	provide 9:20

reliant 10:8 transmittal 8:22 11:14 **stand** 6:12 provided 6:2,7 remit 7:5 **STATE** 2:2 3:7 **truth** 6:17,18 prudence 9:14 reported 2:20 stating 5:16 turn 6:14 11:21 11:7 Reporter 2:21 steps 7:17 9:4,9 turned 8:11 prudent 10:15 required 5:13 7:5, **stress** 11:5 U purchase 10:13 submit 6:5 purpose 7:22 requirements sufficient 7:19.20 unclear 10:1 10:10 9:13 **Suite** 2:17 understaffed respect 6:1 7:14 pursuant 5:12 7:6 10:2 sum 7:20,21,22 Respondent 3:7 8:23 **undue** 11:5 Q respondent's 4:5 **sums** 9:10 unnoticed 7:16 result 7:9 10:15 questions 8:13, supposed 8:23 11:17 14 11:22 12:8 V swear 6:13,16 retained 10:9 quote 9:4 **system** 11:10 view 9:24 Revenue 7:4 12:23,24 R vital 9:24 **RTC** 7:4 **Volume** 7:13 Т raise 6:13,16 S Volumes 11:2 ramification talking 8:10 11:11 school 10:4 tax 2:1 3:7 5:19. W ramifications section 7:6 21,25 6:25 10:2,8, 11:16 9 12:15,16,17 waiting 8:22 sending 9:22,23 ready 6:21 12:13 Taxation 7:4 **wanted** 10:25 services 10:9 real 10:21,22 11:12 taxes 8:13,17 web 12:23,24 realistic 10:7 **shown** 7:8 12:19, taxpayer 7:5 Wednesday 2:19 24 Realtor 6:23 testimony 6:17 5:1,7 **shows** 7:24 reason 9:6 willful 7:9,10,11, thing 7:3 9:3 simple 11:5 13 9:11 reasonable 5:24 things 6:25 8:6,7 7:9,12 11:4,14 wire 7:19 8:5,17, single 5:13 time 5:7,15 10:15, 12:19,22 23 9:13,15 10:19 **sit** 6:13 16,19 11:5,10,18 reasons 8:16 wired 7:24 **sitting** 7:21,22 timely 8:6,7,8,20 received 4:4,5 8:21 9:10,17,20 11:13 wires 10:23 7:25 wiring 9:16 10:11, **small** 5:12 today 12:16 receiving 9:15 **sole** 5:10 Today's 5:7 record 5:5,17 6:1, wonderful 12:1 solemnly 6:16 touch 10:25 4,9 12:5,6,7 Woodland 8:3 TRANSCRIPT sooner 9:8 records 8:11 write 7:23 2:16 **sort** 9:2 referred 11:7 transfer 7:19 8:19 **staff** 10:1,4 regard 9:6

Index: Yadao..year

Υ		
adao 3:8 5:21 2:16		
ear 5:25 8:10,13		